

CONSCIENTIOUS OBJECTIONS: BEYOND THE CONTEXT OF HEALTH CARE?

Patrick Clipsham, PhD
Winona State University

1) Introduction:

- My question: Should conscientious objections be protected outside the context of health care?

2) The Integrity Thesis:

- Conscientious objectors in the context of health care should be afforded professional protection (with some qualifications) because violations of moral integrity result in significant harms to people who are required to act against their own consciences.

3) The Exclusivity Thesis:

■ The professional protections described in the integrity thesis should be provided exclusively to health care professionals.

4) Can the Exclusivity Thesis be Justified? Four False Starts.

- **4A:** Physicians are self-employed individuals and can ‘quit’ the Doctor/Patient relationship.

4) Can the Exclusivity Thesis be Justified? Four False Starts.

- ~~4A: Physicians are self employed individuals and can ‘quit’ the Doctor/Patient relationship.~~
- 4B: Medical choices carry more moral weight.

4) Can the Exclusivity Thesis be Justified? Four False Starts.

- ~~4A: Physicians are self employed individuals and can ‘quit’ the Doctor/Patient relationship.~~
- ~~4B: Medical choices carry more moral weight.~~
- ~~4C: Medicine has an internal morality.~~

4) Can the Exclusivity Thesis be Justified? Four False Starts.

- ~~4A: Physicians are self employed individuals and can ‘quit’ the Doctor/Patient relationship.~~
- ~~4B: Medical choices carry more moral weight.~~
- ~~4C: Medicine has an internal morality.~~
- 4D: Other concerns override the significance of moral integrity outside of healthcare.

4) Can the Exclusivity Thesis be Justified? Four False Starts.

- ~~4A: Physicians are self employed individuals and can ‘quit’ the Doctor/Patient relationship.~~
- ~~4B: Medical choices carry more moral weight.~~
- ~~4C: Medicine has an internal morality.~~
- ~~4D: Other concerns override the significance of moral integrity outside of healthcare.~~

5) Medicine as a Moral Enterprise: A Better Justification?

- **5A:** Physician decision-making should prioritize obligations to patients.

5) Medicine as a Moral Enterprise: A Better Justification?

- ~~5A: Physician decision-making should prioritize obligations to patients.~~
- **5B: Physician decision-making should be informed by ethical standards.**

5) Medicine as a Moral Enterprise: A Better Justification?

- **5A:** Physician decision-making should prioritize obligations to patients.
- **5B:** Physician decision-making should be informed by ethical standards.
- **5C:** Health care providers experience heightened risks to their moral integrity.

5) Medicine as a Moral Enterprise: A Better Justification?

- **5A:** Physician decision making should prioritize obligations to patients.
- **5B:** Physician decision making should be informed by ethical standards.
- **5C:** Health care providers experience heightened risks to their moral integrity.
- **5D:** Moral judgment is a part of medicine.

5) Medicine as a Moral Enterprise: A Better Justification?

- **5A:** Physician decision making should prioritize obligations to patients.
- **5B:** Physician decision making should be informed by ethical standards.
- **5C:** Health care providers experience heightened risks to their moral integrity.
- **5D:** Moral judgment is a part of medicine.

5) Medicine as a Moral Enterprise: A Better Justification?

- **5A:** Physician decision making should prioritize obligations to patients.
- **5B:** Physician decision making should be informed by ethical standards.
- **5C:** Health care providers experience heightened risks to their moral integrity.
- **5D:** Moral judgment is a part of medicine.
- **5E:** Moral integrity is a protective mechanism for patients.

5) Medicine as a Moral Enterprise: A Better Justification?

- **5A:** Physician decision making should prioritize obligations to patients.
- **5B:** Physician decision making should be informed by ethical standards.
- **5C:** Health care providers experience heightened risks to their moral integrity.
- **5D:** Moral judgment is a part of medicine.
- **5E:** Moral integrity is a protective mechanism for patients.

6) Conclusions:

- The most plausible justifications for the exclusivity thesis involve giving up on the integrity thesis and finding other ways of arguing that the integrity of health care professionals is ethically important. If we want to maintain the integrity thesis, we would likely have to extend the right to conscientiously object far beyond the context of health care.